RESEARCH ARTICLE

Nuclear DNA from the extinct Passenger Pigeon (Ectopistes migratorius) confirms a single origin of New World pigeons

Tara L. Fulton a,⇑, Stephen M. Wagner a, Clemency Fisher b, Beth Shapiro a,⇑

a Department of Biology, 320 Mueller Laboratory, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16801, United States
b Department of Zoology, World Museum, National Museums Liverpool, William Brown Street, Liverpool L3 5EN, UK

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received 10 January 2011
Received in revised form 16 February 2011
Accepted 22 February 2011

Keywords:
Ancient DNA
Columbidae
Columbiformes
Pigeons
Doves
Phylogeny
Systematics

SUMMARY

Passenger Pigeons (Ectopistes migratorius) were once the most abundant bird in North America, with flock sizes estimated in the billions. However, by the turn of the 20th century, this previously abundant species had been driven to extinction. Morphological analyses linked the Passenger Pigeon with the New World mourning doves of the genus Zenaida. However, mitochondrial analyses strongly support its placement within the group of typical pigeons and doves (New and Old World pigeons, cuckoo-doves, turtledoves). Here, the first nuclear DNA sequence obtained for this extinct species confirms the placement of the Passenger Pigeon as sister to the New World pigeons, Patagioenas. These findings have implications for the colonization of North America by pigeons and doves.

© 2011 Elsevier GmbH. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Passenger Pigeons (Ectopistes migratorius) were once the most abundant birds in North America, comprising an estimated 20–40% of the total avian population (Schorger, 1973). Initial descriptions referred to “infinite” flocks, while later reports estimated between one and three billion birds flying together (Schorger, 1973). However, these numbers began to fall with European settlement, and the Passenger Pigeon population declined precipitously through the 18th and 19th centuries, culminating in the death of the last known individual in captivity in 1914.

Hunting and deforestation were the primary factors leading to the rapid demise of the Passenger Pigeon during the 18th and 19th centuries. Passenger Pigeons were hunted both in flight or while roosting, and were killed by the thousands; in 1851 nearly two million birds were taken from a single nesting site in New York (Schorger, 1973). Mating pairs of Passenger Pigeons lay a single egg per year; many too few to sustain the population given these heavy losses to hunting. In addition, Passenger Pigeons lived, on average, only five years. As they became increasingly scarce, hunters became less selective in the birds that they captured and even young individuals were taken. By the mid-19th century, the species was nearing extinction, and hunting bans were put into place to try to conserve the remaining birds. New York protected nesting sites in 1862 and similar legislation followed over the course of the next fifteen years in Michigan, Wisconsin, Pennsylvania, Ohio, and Massachusetts (Schorger, 1973). These bans were some of the earliest examples of conservation legislation, paving the way for future conservation action and highlighting the ease with which humans can drive even the most abundant species to extinction. Unfortu-

nately for the Passenger Pigeon, these bans were widely ignored (Schorger, 1973).

Despite widespread attention, very little research has focused on the evolutionary history of the Passenger Pigeon. Originally, the Passenger Pigeon was described as conspecific with the Mourning Dove (Zenaida macroura). It was later placed in the monotypic genus, Ectopistes (Swainson, 1827) but remained within the radiation of the New World mourning doves (Zenaida) (Goodwin, 1967). The Passenger Pigeon is superficially similar to Zenaida. It has fewer tail feathers than the Mourning Dove, Z. macroura, but the same number (twelve) as Z. aurita and Z. galapagoensis (Schorger, 1973; Johnson and Clayton, 2000). It is, however, considerably larger than Zenaida, lacks a facial stripe, has more pronounced sexual colour dimorphism, and smaller clutch size of a single egg (Goodwin, 1967).

In contrast to the morphological assessment, mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) obtained from museum specimens using ancient DNA (aDNA) techniques suggested an association with the typical pigeons and doves, rather than with Zenaida and the ground doves.

* Corresponding authors.
E-mail addresses: tlf19@psu.edu, taralynnfulton@gmail.com (T.L. Fulton), beth.shapiro@psu.edu (B. Shapiro).

0940-9602/$ – see front matter © 2011 Elsevier GmbH. All rights reserved.
doi:10.1016/j.aanat.2011.02.017
2. Materials and methods

2.1. DNA isolation, amplification, and sequencing

A toe pad sample of *E. migratorius* was received from National Museums Liverpool (museum ID: Canon H.B. Tristram Collection LIV T17065). DNA extraction and all pre-PCR work was performed in a dedicated aDNA facility at The Pennsylvania State University that is housed in a separate building from any laboratories that perform genetic analysis. Ancient DNA protocols were strictly adhered to at all stages including, but not limited to, the use of full body suits and face masks, “one-way” movement of reagents, supplies, and workers prohibiting any PCR-contaminated material from entering the facility, sterile reagents and plasticware, and sterilization of surfaces and equipment with bleach and ethanol (Cooper and Poinar, 2000; Gilbert et al., 2005). Toe pad tissue was cut into small pieces and DNA was isolated using the Qiagen DNeasy Tissue Kit (Qiagen) with an extended initial lysis step of four days and additional proteinase K to ensure complete tissue lysis. An extraction negative control (no tissue sample) was carried out simultaneously.

In order to compare sequences for *Ectopistes* to the greatest number of species within Columbidae, intron 7 of the nuclear-encoded fibrinogen beta chain (*FGB*) gene was selected for sequencing. Due to the level of fragmentation incurred by aDNA, a series of primers were designed to amplify a series of short overlapping fragments (Table 1). PCR amplifications were performed in 25 μL reactions comprising 50 μg rabbit serum albumin, 0.25 mM dNTPs, 1× High Fidelity buffer, 1.25 units Platinum Taq High Fidelity (Invitrogen), 3 mM MgSO₄, 1 μM of each primer, and 1 μL DNA extract. Cycling conditions were 94 °C for 30 s, 50 cycles of 94 °C for 45 s, 45 s at 48–56 °C (Table 1), 68 °C for 90 s followed by 10 min of 68 °C. Negative PCR reactions (containing no DNA extract) were included for each amplification reaction. PCR products were cleaned using Millipore Multiscreen PCRµ96 filter plates and sequenced with BigDye v3.1 chemistry (Applied Biosystems). Following ethanol/EDTA precipitation, sequences were resolved on an ABI3730xl DNA Analyzer (Applied Biosystems) at the Penn State Genomics Core Facility (University Park). To assess DNA damage and screen for contamination, each amplification was also cloned using the TOPO TA cloning kit (Invitrogen) according to manufacturers’ instructions. Several clones from each sample were sequenced using the M13F primer (TOPO manual). All sequences were visualized and aligned using Lasergene 8 (DNASTAR).

2.2. Phylogenetic analysis

DNA sequence is available from *E. migratorius* for three mitochondrial genes: *ATP8*, 12S rRNA, and *cytb* (Shapiro et al., 2002; Johnson et al., 2010). The sequence for these genes and *FGB* for a wide selection of Columbiformes was retrieved from GenBank and each locus was aligned using MAFFT v6.0 under the ‘moderately accurate’ automatic strategy (Katoh et al., 2002). The final aligned data set includes 122 taxa (116 Columbiformes, 6 outgroups), 415 bp for 12S rRNA, 1045 bp for *cytb*, 169 bp for *ATP8*, and 529 bp for *FGB*, as alignments were trimmed to maximize overlap with *Ectopistes* sequences. Forty-seven taxa were missing data for 12S, one was missing *cytb*, 29 were missing for *ATP8*, and 30 were missing *FGB*. GenBank accession numbers and references for those sequences that were included in our analysis are provided as Supplementary Table S1. An additional nine taxa were removed from analyses including only *FGB* because they were either identical to or differed by a single bp from another taxon from the same genus and fell within a well-represented, well-supported clade (analyses not shown). This is indicated in Supplementary Table S1.

The best fitting model of evolution was selected using jModelTest (Posada, 2008). The general time reversible model, a proportion of invariant sites and gamma distributed rate heterogeneity (GTR+I+G) was selected for each gene. Maximum likelihood (ML) and ML bootstrapping (MLB; 100 pseudoreplicates) were performed in RAXML 7.0.4 (Stamatakis, 2006) using a partitioned analysis and rapid bootstrapping (option -f a) with the GTR+GAMMA model for both the combined data set and FGB alone. Bayesian inference was conducted in MrBayes v. 3.2 (Huelsenbeck and Ronquist, 2001; Ronquist and Huelsenbeck, 2003) for both the combined data set and FGB alone. Two runs of 5 million generations each were performed simultaneously, sampling every 200 generations. Each gene was given its own partition with unlinked model parameters. Convergence was assessed using the sump command to visualize the trace and calculate a potential scale reduction factor (PSRF) of ~1.00. A burnin of 10% of samples was removed. All trees were visualized in FigTree v.1.3.1 (http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software/figtree).

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primer set</th>
<th>Forward primer</th>
<th>Reverse primer</th>
<th>Annealing temp. (°C)</th>
<th>Fragment length* (bp)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F283</td>
<td>AGCACTTTTCTGCTAGTCAAGT</td>
<td>GTTTATATGTTGAAAATGTCCAGT</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F384</td>
<td>TGATCTACACAGTACTAGCTCCTG</td>
<td>TCCATCTCCATGGTCCTGCTG</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F485</td>
<td>ACATATTTAAACCATTAAATCTTCTC</td>
<td>AATATCCATCTGAAACAAATGACA</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F585</td>
<td>AGCACTTTGCAAAAACATCAAAA</td>
<td>GCGAACACATACTTCTGATCTT</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F687</td>
<td>CATACTATGCTGATAATCCA</td>
<td>GTGCTGCGCTTTATCTTATTA</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F788</td>
<td>TTTCTTATCTCAGATGCGTCA</td>
<td>AAAGTGCTGCGATCGTGGACA</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Fragment length includes primers.
Fig. 1. Molecular phylogeny of Columbidae including the extinct Passenger Pigeon based on maximum likelihood analysis of FGB intron 7 sequence. Branch lengths were optimized in RAxML and the values for each node represent ML bootstrap (MLBP)/Bayesian posterior probability (BPP) support. Nodes supported by 100% MLBP and BPP > 1.0 are indicated with a star; nodes with <75% MLBP and BPP < 0.95 are unlabeled, except for some nodes discussed in text. Common names are indicated on the right.
3. Results

A final FGB sequence of 444 bp was produced for Ectopistes (GenBank Accession JF312866). Cloning results indicated nine sites where one clone contained one base and the other 3–14 clones contained a different base, either due to DNA damage or PCR error. There were no cases where the number of clones appeared evenly split between two bases, thus, no heterozygous sites were inferred. The ratio of Type II: Type I transitions of 5:2 is consistent with previous analyses of ancient nuclear DNA (Binladen et al., 2006). Ectopistes was recovered as the sister taxon of Patagioenas (New World pigeons) in all analyses, with moderately strong support.
support (MLBP = 74, Bayesian posterior probability (BPP) = 0.98) in the FGB-only analyses (Fig. 1) and in the combined gene analyses (Fig. 2; MLBP = 76, BPP = 0.95). In all analyses, Ectopistes was strongly supported as belonging to the typical pigeons and doves group (Figs. 1 and 2). Within this group, Streptopelia (turtle-doves) and Columba (Old World pigeons) are supported as sister (Figs. 1 and 2). Cuckoo-doves (Macropygia, Reiuwardtoena, Tura- coena) are supported as sister to the Streptopelia-Columba clade strongly by FGB (MLBP = 90, BPP = 0.97) but recovered as sister to Ectopistes-Patagioenas (MLBP = 69, BPP = 0.66), in the combined analyses.

4. Discussion

4.1. Phylogenetic position of the passenger pigeon

To date, mtDNA has dominated aDNA research. Its high copy number means that even though many copies of the targeted region will become damaged and fragmented through time, a sufficient number will remain intact to allow PCR amplification. Conversely, each cell has only two copies of most nuclear loci, complicating their recovery from degraded specimens. As DNA extraction and sequencing techniques become more sensitive, however, the ability to isolate genetic information from the nuclear genome has become increasingly viable. This is particularly important for addressing systematic questions within Columbiformes, where the earliest divergences are estimated to have occurred ~55 MYA (Perea et al., 2007). Indeed, mitochondrial genes have shown 3rd codon position saturation even within a subset of the Columbiformes examined here (Johnson et al., 2001).

Here, we use nuclear DNA to resolve the phylogenetic position of the extinct Passenger Pigeon, E. migratorius. Previous analyses of mtDNA from this species supported the inclusion of the Passenger Pigeon with the New and Old World pigeons, turtledoves, and cuckoo-doves (Shapiro et al., 2002; Johnson et al., 2010), but its exact placement within this group remained unsupported. Using 444 bp of newly generated sequence from the nuclear gene FGB intron 7 and previously obtained mtDNA sequence for Ectopistes, we confirm the inclusion of Ectopistes within the typical pigeons and doves group with strong statistical support (Figs. 1 and 2). In addition, our results support its placement as the sister taxon to other New World pigeons, Patagioenas (Fig. 2), consistent with another recent analysis (Johnson et al., 2010). Thus, the addition of nuclear DNA confirms a single origin of New World pigeons.

Our nuclear results for the basal relationships within the typical pigeons and doves contrast with mitochondrial-only analyses (Gibb and Penny, 2010) and combined FGB + mtDNA analyses (Fig. 2; Johnson et al., 2010) that recover the cuckoo-doves (Macropygia, Reiuwardtoena, Tura coena) as sister to the New World pigeons (Ectopistes and Patagioenas). Our FGB data suggest that the cuckoo-doves are more closely related to the Old World pigeons and turtledoves (Columba and Streptopelia), although the addition of mtDNA data reduces the support for this until the relationship is no longer recovered. However, our FGB-only analyses support the cuckoo-doves + Columba + Streptopelia clade strongly (Fig. 1), yielding a hypothesis for this subfamily that, to our knowledge, has not yet been explored.

4.2. Taxonomy

Our results agree with other molecular studies that taxonomic revision of Columbiformes is required. From a purely molecular viewpoint, the number of genera could likely be reduced (Gibb and Penny, 2010), including the recently suggested synonymiza tion of Alectroenas and Dreptanoptila with Pitilinopus (Gibb and Penny, 2010). As observed previously (Johnson, 2004), paraphyly of Geotrygon is strongly supported (Figs. 1 and 2), as is the paraphyly of Gallicolumba (Fig. 2; Shapiro et al., 2002). However, taxonomic revision of genera and higher classifications will require a more in-depth molecular examination than has been performed to date with comprehensive re-evaluation of the morphology of Columbiformes.

4.3. Basal relationships and biogeographic implications

The inability to resolve the basal relationships within Columbiformes persists whether several mtDNA loci or mtDNA plus nuclear loci are analyzed, and regardless of the phylogenetic estimation methodologies applied (Perea et al., 2007; Gibb and Penny, 2010; Johnson et al., 2010). Resolving the basal relationships of pigeons and doves will be necessary before a full understanding of the biogeographic history of the order can be attained. For example, reconstructing the ancestral location of the typical pigeons and doves, zebra dove and quail doves (Fig. 2; Clade “A” from Pereira et al. (2007)) is likely to be affected by the inferred relationships within the typical pigeons and doves. Johnson et al. (2010) postu late a trans-Pacific migration of the Ectopistes-Patagioenas ancestor to the New World based on their recovered sister relationship with the S.E. Asian cuckoo-doves as in our combined analysis (Fig. 2). However, our FGB-only results (Fig. 1) could also be congruent with Pereira et al. (2007) who propose a Neotropical origin for the typical pigeons and doves. Although sophisticated methods exist to reconstruct ancestral location probabilities, the lack of resolution along the backbone of our recovered phylogeny (Figs. 1, 2) indicates insufficient information to apply such methods. However, increased molecular and taxonomic sampling including both extinct and extant taxa should provide more information to resolve these evolutionary rapid basal radiations.

Acknowledgements

Many thanks to National Museums Liverpool for providing Ectopistes material for analysis and to two anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments. Funding for this research was provided by the Pennsylvania State University as startup funds to BS and an Undergraduate Discovery Grant to SMW.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.aanat.2011.02.017.

References


